



A Historical Review of Governance in Pakistan (1947-2012)

Vol. IV, No. I (Winter 2019) | Page: 320 – 325 | DOI: 10.31703/grr.2019(IV-I).34

p- ISSN: 2616-955X | e-ISSN: 2663-7030 | ISSN-L: 2616-955X

Sajjad Ahmad*

Muqarrab Akbar†

Abstract

The present study attempts to make an understanding of the concept of governance and evaluation of its micro-macro level of application on governance in Pakistan by using the model of McCawley theory 2005. In this article overall performance of governance regimes in the history of the country with the major focus on the administrative-economic results of their policies and decisions have been highlighted. Pakistan's political stability, social development and industrial growth have always been victimized by its interest groups and elites. Pakistan's weak political leaders always created a gap between civil and military bureaucracy and caused military regimes to rule the state. Today the country's development is partial. The literacy rate is going better and active media have come up. Civil society has become assertive. The middle class is flourishing and Pakistanis are having the desire to have peace in the country.

Key Words: Political, Governance, weakness, Military, Dominancy, Accountability

Introduction

Governance is, in fact, a difficult process and accurate governance include various kinds of formulation of the method, decisions and policy to implement in the country. It depends on the leadership to find the possible sources and manage both long- and short-term policies as well as micro and macro level. The author adopted the McCawley governance theory that had been done in Indonesia.

Problem of Statement

Since their inception, Pakistan's institutions had a system of governance that was influenced by the political system of the British. The major reason is that there is no trust amongst all institutions of the state. In the late 70- years of Pakistan's history, four times Martial Laws were imposed. It aggravated the situation of the governance to run the country is smooth and in a broken way.

Method

The present research focused mainly on quantitative and qualitative methods. The qualitative method described the characteristic of Pakistan's governance economically, politically and socially to examine the present situation. The statistical data and analysis mentioned the quantitative portion by the use of the explanatory method to make an understanding of Pakistan's governance.

Review of Literature

Ilahn, (2010), mentioned in his book that even up to 6-decades after the emergence of Pakistan, the behavior of Pakistan's governments had not been developed. It has spoiled the moral and intellectual quality of the country's machinery.

Shekahr and Singh, (2009), in their book "The Military Factor in Pakistan", described that military interferences were serious factor in deciding the future route of Pakistan Military interference in the Geo-political, strategic, Economic, Sociological and religious matters of the country had shown Pakistan into failed state and the country is at the critical juncture of its history.

Tahir, (2008), claimed while answering the question of why democracy was challenged, that few people made their opportunity by understanding the spirit of the socio-political and economic condition of Pakistan and controlled the country.

*PhD Scholar, Department of Political Sciences, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Punjab, Pakistan.

Email: sajjadahmadmaitla@yahoo.com

† Professor, Department of Political Sciences, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Punjab, Pakistan.

He further claimed that being a nation we ought to assimilate that religious, ethnic, cultural classes were our power if they worked for the welfare of the public. But it is unfortunate that they had their own problems and aspirations that caused troubles, agitations, and strife due to which civil rule became difficult and the army had to intervene and derailed democracy four times.

Mehmood, (2007), stated in the book “Good Governance Reforms Agenda in Pakistan: Current Challenges”, that even after almost 6-decades since its existence, the country was facing severe governance crisis. Economic and Political Development at the global level was affecting the country. Pakistan was facing complex challenges which were threatening its stability. Pakistan became a part of the Global War against terrorism by the USA due to regional conditions. It made Pakistan face complex and during challenges that threatened its stability.

Cohen, (2004), stated that India was expected to be one of the three important countries in South Asia. Its outstanding era of democracy benefited the country. Its economic freedom was getting 6% of yearly annual growth and its exports become more than 3-billions dollars strengthening the military power. On the other hand, Pakistani governance could not make itself economically.

Historical Review of Governance in Pakistan

Since the inception of Pakistan faced huge challenges, the death of its founder caused great troubles to the future of Pakistan. Incapable leaders after Quaid-e-Azam might tackle with the then issues. After the demise of Quaid-e-Azam, Liaquat Ali Khan continually remained Prime Minister of the country. He terminated the Mamdot Ministry (Shehab, 1990, pp. 79-80), introduced the Public and Representative Officers Disqualification Act, 1949 (PRODA) and framed an advisory council of advice. During his tenure on March 12th 1949 objective resolution was passed (Shehab, Fifty Years of Pakistan, 1990, p. 80). His second step was to set up the Basic Principal Committee to present a recommendation for the next constitution. It was a blunder of Liaquat Ali Khan that he visited Washington instead of Moscow (Hussain M. &, 1993, p. 31). Liaquat Ali Khan was killed, Ghulam Muhammad became the Governor-General of Pakistan and Khawaja Nazimuddin became Premier of Pakistan. In this era, the government of Khawaja Nazimuddin could not control the economic crisis, food crisis and other major issues properly. The public gave him the title of Quaid-i-Qillat (Shehab P. U., 1990, p. 94). Liaquat Ali Khan committed another mistake of foreign policy by accepting an invitation from Washington instead of Moscow. If he would have accepted the invitation from Moscow the history of the world would have a better picture today. The Governor-General Ghulam Muhammad terminated Khawaja Nazimuddin and it was an undemocratic step (Niaz, 2010, pp. 82-83). Then Muhammad Ali Bogra became Prime Minister of Pakistan from 1954 to July 1958 semi dictatorial governance prevailed in the country and civilian forces remained treated (Rizvi, 1976, p. 70). After a decade, President Iskandar Mirza declared Martial Law on 7th October 1958. In some days Gen. Muhammad Ayub Khan, the Chief Martial Law Administrator dismissed Iskandar Mirza and became President of the country. In the beginning, Pakistan had only 200 million dollars. Every governor allocated a large portion of the budget for defense matters (Talbot, 1999, p. 58)

The Bogra's governance introduced 1st 5-Year Plan in 1955-60, it was to develop agriculture, power, industry, education, health, the betterment of men for training, communication, housing, transport, village agriculture industries etc. (Shehab, 1990, pp. 112-113).

Ayub's Governance

General Ayub Khan took action against the black marketers, corrupt civil servants. He made it clear democracy was not suitable for the welfare of Pakistan. He also introduced the Local Bodies System known as Basic Democratic People System (B.D). General Ayub Khan took some steps, which proved to be helpful in improving the basic living standard of the people. However, 22 families had control of wealth. (Khan, 2001, p. 184). In the end, the laborers, students and peasants class forced General Ayub Khan to give his power to National Assembly Speaker but instead of this General Yahya Khan took over the Government and declared Martial law (Ziring, 1997, p. 316).

General Yahya Khan's Governance

On 30th March 1970, General Yahya Khan presented Legal Frame Work Order (LFO) for the future election. The elections were held in the 2nd week of December. Awami League won the election in East-Pakistan, whereas PPP secured 81-seats of the National Assembly in West Pakistan. It became the reason for the breakup of Pakistan (Ziring, 1997, pp. 325-326).

Bhutto Governance (1971-77)

Between 1971-77 Zulfikar Ali Bhutto ruled Pakistan. His party Pakistan Peoples Party (PPP) started social, economic and political reform in Pakistan. In 1972 the PPP government nationalized 32 largest Industries units in 10-categories. (Lallement, 1985, p. 381). Bhutto made significant changes in the country. He gave permanent constitution of 1973 and seventh amendments were also presented. His government noticed some social evils and even non-Islamic practices like dowry

(Shehab, 1990, p. 279). But the yearly growth of GNP fluctuated throughout his government tenure. Growth declined from 6.65% in the 1960s to 0.45% from 1972 to 1976 (Mushahid Hussain, 1993, p. 3). Credit expansion and the nationalization of Banks led to the heavy deficit. (Hussain, Hussain, 1993, p. 4). As a result, opposition rose against Prime Minister Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and contested election on a common platform of Pakistan National Alliance (PNA). PNA was defeated in the election. On 5th July 1977, Bhutto was removed by Gen. Zia-ul-Haq and he was sent to jail (Lawrence, 2004, p. 160).

Governance of Zia-Ul-Haq (1977-88)

Zia government had a religious ideology, it introduced Zakat, Hadood, Penal Courts and Usher. A Sharia Court was also established to decide cases according to the orders of the Holy Quran and Sunnah. He also started other programs of Islamization, he introduced a system of Profit & lost Sharing, 'Chadar Aur Chaar Devari' Nizam-e-Salaat, and other programs to strengthen Pseudo Islamic ideology. During General Zia-ul-Haq's tenure, Pakistan's per capita income increased by 34% and GNP increased by 76%. Economy boosted and Pakistan made the remittances of 25 billion dollars (Burki, p. 107). The other problem of law and order aroused for that matter he announced general election within 90-days. Nevertheless, Muhammad Khan Junejo government passed the 8th amendment in favor of the President Gen. Zia-ul-Haq that defaced the constitution of 1973. That started the political strife between Prime Minister Muhammad Khan Junejo and President General Zia-ul-Haq (Talbot, Pakistan A New History, 2012, p. 266). In the end, General Zia-ul-Haq removed Muhammad Khan Junejo's government by using Article 58 (2(b), but soon after the dismissal of Prime Minister Muhammad Khan Junejo, Zia was killed in an air crash.

Democratic Cum Civilian Rule

After the death of General Zia-ul-Haq, the General Elections were held in August 1988. Ms. Benazir Bhutto the daughter of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto won the elections on the plate-form of PPP and she became the Premier of Pakistan. There was a contradiction between PPP & IJI due to which she did not perform well. IJI was led by Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif and challenged her government. The Prime Minister Ms. Benazir had to leave her seat on sixth August 1990. In 1990 Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif took oath as premier of Pakistan, after the General Elections, he struggled to strengthen the industrial sector with the helping hand of Private sector. His government faced issues of political nature especially in the province of Sindh Nawaz government also increased the oil prices over 40%. He also limited the prerogatives of Commissioners and Inspector General (I.G.) Police of Islamabad. He introduced the economic reforms of 1991-1992 (Hamid Khan, 2010, p. 413). On the micro-level, he created especial tribunals related to serious crimes. For that matter, the 12th amendment was passed by parliament in 1991.

"Stephen P. Cohen has had astutely pointed out that Nawaz Sharif's rapid privatization program may also have upset the military because it increases commercial competition to counter the establishment interests of its powerful foundations" (Cohen, 2004, p. 251).

In 1993 political strife between the then president Ishaq Khan and Prime Minister Mian Mohammad Nawaz Sharif over the appointment of Chief of Army Staff. After the strange death of Gen. Asif Nawaz Jenjua (Shafqat, 1997, p. 238). In 1993 Muhammad Nawaz Sharif Premier of Pakistan was dismissed and the new General Election was announced. In that General Election, PPP was successful and Benazir Bhutto became the new Prime Minister of the country. Soon after she took power catastrophic floods caused billions of rupees loss to agriculture mainly destroyed cotton, rice and sugarcane crops on a large scale. Though, PPP known as a feudal party, even her government did not succeed to bring the country out of the economic crisis (Shafqat, 1997, p. 246).

Inflation of rupee, corruption, poor management, the bad government increased the problems for her government. Pakistan's foreign reserve remained 600 million dollars (Malik, 2001, pp. 218-219). The political differences between PPP and President Farooq Khan Leghari dismissed her government in 1996. As a result of new elections in 1997, Nawaz Sharif again became the Prime Minister of Pakistan with the heavy mandate.

There was a serious Tussle between President Farooq Ahmad Leghari and Prime Minister Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif. On the issue of Council for Defence and National Security Council (NSC). The Council was removed by Prime Minister Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif's government through the 13th Amendment in the 1973 Constitution.

Nawaz Sharif introduced 14th, 15th and 16th Amendments in order to make Kitchen Cabinet strong. Even he had 2/3 majority, it was difficult to work for him to pay off the loan of 1.2 billion dollars to IMF. Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif consulted the public to launch a program of "Qarz Utaro, Mulk Sanvaro" (retired debt, develop the country). His request brought positive results but it was a complete failure (Talbot, Pakistan A New History, 2012, p. 331).

The Indian Nuclear tests on May 11-13th, 1998 posed a threat to Pakistan security & integrities. It became imminent for Pakistan to respond In order to maintain deterrence to equilibrium in the region. Pakistan also tested its nuclear weapons (Advani Tells Pk to Roll Back India Policy or Else, 1998). It caused many problems for the Nawaz government, economics

sanctions were imposed by USA civil, military relations were also worsened. (Khan A. K., 2008). At last on 12th October 1999. Prime Minister Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif was ousted by General Pervez Musharraf.

Governance of General Pervez Musharraf

On October 12th, 1999 Gen. Pervez Musharraf declared an emergency and he made himself a Chief Executive. After the dismissal of the Government of Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif the Grand Democratic Alliance (GDA) which was a multi-party alliance including Pakistan People Party (PPP) welcome the decision and even GDA welcomed General Pervez Musharraf. After 5-days of the military takeover, he announced the following 7-points agenda for the National Reconstruction:-

- i) Re-building of national confidence and moral;
- ii) Strengthening of the federation by removal of interprovincial disharmony and restoration of national cohesion ;
- iii) The revival of economy and restoration of investors' confidence;
- iv) Ensuring law and order and dispensing speedy justice;
- v) Depoliticization of state institutions;
- vi) Devolution of power to grass root level, and
- vii) Ensuring swift and across the board accountability;

In this regard, Musharraf brought constitutional reforms with the help of the National Reconstruction Bureau which was headed by Tanveer Naqvi and these reforms were implemented under Legal Frame Work Order (L.F.O.) of August 21, 2002. Musharraf also set up the National Accountability Bureau (NAB) through a special ordinance, which was challenged in the court and the Supreme Court of Pakistan suggested some amendments need to be made by the federal government. Musharraf also introduced Police Act 2002 reforms headed by Zafar Iqbal Rathore as a Chairman of Police Reforms. However, Musharraf did not accept the suggestion of the Chairman and implemented the 2002 Police Act in its real spirit i.e. district police will perform their duties under the supervision of Elected District Nazim of Local Government and also District Nazim deputed delegation power to write Annual Confidential Report (ACR). The Legal Frame Work Order formulated the National Security Council (NSC) and which gave the authority to have a legal institutional role in the Government. General Pervez Musharraf had to face the problem of justifying his action to initiate after redesigning the political process. Head of National Reconstruction Bureau Mr. Tanveer Naqvi introduced the structure of district governance which was headed by districts and Deputy Mayor (Nazim and Naib Nazim) who had been selected by the elected members of the Union Council within their own districts. The Tehsil Nazim through in Musharraf Devolution Plan, they also selected from the elected members of the Union Council.

In 2001, the 9/11 event took place Bush administration forced Pakistan to help in the war against terrorism against Al-Qaida in Afghanistan. In return, the USA lifted offered financial assistance in coalition support fund and also lifted economic sanctions after nuclear tests of 1998. The Bush government provided 5-billion dollars in economic and military aid and announced Pakistan a major non-NATO ally. Professor Hassan Askari Rizvi, an eminent political scientist comments mentioned below.

In the field of economic development, Pakistan is far better today than it was a few years ago. But it reduces religious intolerance and sectarianism. A fair system of accountability is to be introduced. We should strive to transform our society that adheres to constitutionalism, the rule of law, representative governance, religious and cultural tolerance, genuine federalism, and a guarantee of civil and political rights and freedom.

NATO forces used drone missile technology in Afghanistan against Al-Qaida in Afghanistan & Iraq including Pakistan with the permission of the Pakistani Government. Musharraf is also publically admitted granted permission to US forces for Drone attacks. (Dawn, 2013) In October 2002 the Gen. election was held, Pakistan Muslim League (Q) supported by the Musharraf regime succeeded in the election and Mir Zafarullah Jamali became Premier of Pakistan (Shah, 2003).

In 2004 Ch.Shujat replaced him for forty-five days and then Shoukat Aziz became Prime Minister of Pakistan in 2004. General Pervez Musharraf wanted Motahida Majlis Ammal (MMA) to rectify his LFO through the 17th amendment in the constitution of 1973 and they supported him wholeheartedly.

As time passed General Pervez government became weaker and weaker due to different factors such as suspension of Chief Justice Iftikhar Ch., Lal Masjid (Red Mosque) incident and killing of Akbar Bugti. Instead of bringing economic and social up gradation signed the National Reconciliation Ordinance (NRO) with Benazir Bhutto. The commonwealth Pakistan's membership had been suspended in November. After killing of Benazir Bhutto in Rawalpindi on 27th December 2007. Musharraf got out of the politics, new elections were announced. In the general elections, 2008 PPP came into power (Talbot, 2014, p. 423).

Civilian Government of Asif Ali Zardari

After Benazir's killing Asif Ali Zardari took control of PPP and became a significant figure in Pakistan's politics. He made a collations government with Awami National Party (ANP). Pakistan People Party nominated Syed Yousuf Raza Gillani as the Prime Minister of Pakistan. Yousuf Raza Gillani took oath at President House. (Dawn, 2008). Soon after Pakistan Muslim League (N) left the federal government in May 2008 due to the matter of deadlock on the issue of restoration of judges. Pakistan Muslim League (N) supported the government in the parliament to restore judges including Chief Justice of Pakistan. On the matter of impeachment of General Pervez Musharraf, the parliamentarians demanded that President General Pervez Musharraf seek a vote of confidence. This made Musharraf decide to resign from the Presidentship in 2008. He was replaced by Asif Ali Zardari and he became President of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan. He was not a popular president due to his corruption-tainted past (Lodhi, 2014, p. 50).

The PPP Government was exposed in August 2008 when the law minister announced publically that Justice Abdul Dogar was the rightful Chief Justice of Pakistan. It was the clear picture that the PPP was denying policy to restore Chief Justice Iftikhar Ch. On this issue Muslim League (N) decided to held Long March with the support of lawyers, and other political parties. On the issue of restoration of C.J. Iftikhar Choudhry and PPP broke the Murree summit agreement. However, Gen. Kayani intervened due to which Chief Justice Iftikhar was restored in 2009. In 2010 Obama administration wanted the Pakistan government to extend Kayani's tenure to continue the fight against terrorism. The government of PPP did not object and obliged both Kiyani and the United States by giving Kayani a 3-year extension (The Nation, 2010). During the Zardari regime, the Memo gate scandal happened in which Hussain Haqqani convinced the American Government not to give aid to the Army directly unless the Pakistani civilian government involved. The military, in any case, was responsible for different events. American contractor CIA Raymond Davis case, after killing three Pakistani citizens and Abbottabad Operation 2011, (Testimony of Ahmed Shuja Pasha, p. 204). In November 2011 Pakistan declared India as the most favored nation (MFN) to normalize trade with India. It was against security principles (Aqil Shah, 2014, p. 226). Security and Economic problems became closely interlinked, Foreign exchange reserves were only 3.4 billion dollars (Talbot, 2012, p. 204). The flood disaster was the major setback for the economy. However, Zardari government got financial aid from Kerry Lugar Bill passed in which proposed 1.5 billion per year in non-military aid for 5-years. To support counter-terrorism efforts, the military commented operations in Swat, Malakand and Waziristan. There was no deliverance of civilian government but the government declared 7th National Finance Commission Award (NFC) unanimously. Zardari government passed the 18th amendment in the constitution and also secured mutual passage of the 19th and 20th amendments to the constitution which dealt with the problems related to the Election Commission of Pakistan and Judiciary. PPP government handed over health, education, labor force, population and tourism ministries to all the provinces. It also declared the package of socio-economic reforms for Baluchistan under the title Agaz-e-Haqooq-e-Baluchistan. Zardari government also started Benazir Income Supports Program (BISP) for the poorer sections of the country. Yusuf Raza Gillani was dismissed due to the charge of contempt of court in June 2012 (Dawn, 2010).

Conclusion

The political history of Pakistan is full of crisis, the absence of rule of law disputes between the federation and provinces of Pakistan, political instability and non-serious behavior of the ruler caused great damage to the country. Pakistan's governance had always been a shuttle between military and civilian governments. After the demise of Quaid-i-Azam, no ruler was successful to lead Pakistan properly. Several members of the elite class government get favor from civil and military bureaucracy to establish political parties. That widened the distance between the ruler and the ruled. It was imminent to remove the main causes in the field of socio-economic factors at the micro and macro levels. By and large 18th amendment ensured the role of the parliament in legislation.

In the field of economics, the Ayub government improved GDP, the Bhutto regime was slow, Gen. Zia-ul-Haq propagated Islamization and changed the 1973 constitution by using the 8th amendment but all of them ignored the public interests. After 9/11 Musharraf government bettered diplomatic relations and economy with the different countries. During the Zardari rule, the development indicators showed a bad percentage in the socio-economic field. Zardari government also took better steps between Iran-Pak Gas-pipe line and Gwadar Port agreements were its examples.

References

- Advani Tells Pk to Roll Back India Policy or Else. (1998, May 18). Retrieved from <https://m.rediff.com/news/1998/may/18advani.htm>
- Akhtar. (2009). *The Profile of Politicians and Military Persons*.
- Ali, S. S. (2003). *Pakistan Issues of Government and Politics*. Lahore: Haji Hanif Printers.
- Shah, A. (2014). *The Army and Democracy Military Politics in Pakistan*. India: Gopsons Papers Ltd.
- Baghel, C.L. (2006). *Goog Governance Concept and Approaches*. New Delhi: Kanishka Publisher, .
- Burki, S. (n.d.). *Pakistan's Economy Under Zia*.
- Campbel, D. R. (19963). *Pakistan; Emerging Democracy*. . New York: D.V. Nostrand Company.
- Cohen, S. P. (2004). *Idea of Pakistan*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Dawn. (1990, 16, November). Karachi.
- Dawn. (1999, October 31). C.E. Order No.6 under the Provisional Constitutional Order, 1999. Karachi.
- Dawn. (2003, August 6). Nawaz Couldn't Have Impeached Me: Leghari. Karachi.
- Dawn. (2012, March 14). Akber Bugti Committed Suicide, Claims Musharraf. Karachi.
- Donald H. Chew JR. Sturat L. Gilla. (2005). *Corporate Governance at the Crossroads*. New Delhi: Tata McGraw-Hill Publishing Company Limited.
- Haq, R. & Zia, U. (2009). Does Governance Contribute to Pro-Poor and growth Evidence from Pakistan. *Pakistan Institute of Development, Islamabad*.
- Hussain, M. & Hussain, A. (1993). *Pakistan Problems of Governance*. New Dehli: Vanguard Book Pvt. Ltd.
- Kamran, T. (2008). Democracy and Governance in Pakistan. *Journal of South Asia*.
- Khan, H. (2001). *Constitutional and Political History of Pakitan*. UK: Oxford University Press.
- Khan, K. (1996, November 5). Bhutto out as Premier in Pakistan; President Charges Corruption, Dissolve National Assembly,. *Washington Post*. Pentagon, USA.
- Lallement, Z. (1985). *Pakistan in the 80s Ideology, Regional, Economy, Foreign Policy*. Lahore: Vanguard Book Pvt. Ltd.
- Leghari, I. f. (2009, July). (A. Islamabad, Interviewer)
- Lodhi, M. (2014). *Pakistan Beyond the Crises State*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Malik, F. (1992). *Pakistan Hakumat Aur Siasat*. Lahore : Maktab Ilam-u-Adab.
- Mushahid, H., Akmal, H. (1993). *Pakistan Problems of Governance*. New Delhi: Vanguard Book Pvt. Ltd.
- Niaz, I. (2010). *The Culture of Power and Governance of Pakistan, 1947-2008*. Karachi: Oxford University, Press.
- Shehab, P.R. (1990). *Fifty Years of Pakistan*. Lahore: Maqbool Academy.
- Ravi, S., & Narain, S. (2009). *The Military Factor in Pakistan*. Karachi: Lancer Publishers.
- Rhodes, W. (2007, November 25). Pakistan Middle Class, Beneficiary of Musharraf, begins to question Rule. New York Times.
- Rizvi, H. A. (1976). *The Military and Politics in Pakistan*. Lahore: Fisco Press Ferozepur Road, Ichhra.
- Shafqat, S. (1997). *civil-Military Relations in Pakistan From Zulfikar Ali Bhutto To Benazir Bhutto*. Lahore: WestviewPressPak Book Corporation.
- Shah, A. (2014). *The Army and Democry Military Politics in Pakistan*. London: Harvard University Press.
- Shehab, P. R. (1990). *Fifty Years of Pakistan*. Lahore: Maqbool Academy.
- Siddiqui, K. (2004). *Megacity goernance in South Asia A Comparative study*. Dhaka: the University Press.
- Wolpert, S. (2005). *Encyclopedia of Pakistan*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Talbot, I. (2012). *Pakistan A New History*. Karachi: Oxford University Press,.
- Talbot, I. (1999). *Pakistan A Modern History*. Lahore: Vanguard Book Pvt. Ltd.
- Tariq, L. G. (2008, December). Weekly Friday Times and Adviser in the Caretaker Government. (Najam Sethi, Interviewer)
- Ziring, L. (1997). *Pakistan in the Twentieth Century A Political History*. New Yory: Oxford University Press.
- Ziring, L. (1997). *Pakistan in the Twentieth Century A Political History*. Oxford university Press .
- Ziring, L. (2004). *Pakistan At the Crosscurrent History*. Lahore: Vanguard Books Ptv Ltd.