Effective Management of Secondary School Head Teachers in Punjab: A Comparative Study

Muhammad Shabbir Ali* | Muhammad Arshad† | Shafqat Rasool‡

Abstract

Heads are leading figures in educational institutions responsible for the training of future generations but also have to perform many key functions to achieve the predetermined objectives. The objective was a comparison of management effectiveness between direct selectees and promoted secondary school headteachers of Punjab. A close-ended rating scale consisting of 25 statements was developed on five-point Likert scale for 464 senior Secondary School Teachers (SSTs) selected through multistage random sampling. Nine district educational administrators were interviewed using structured interview schedule. Reliability was assured as 0.83 by test and re-test approach. After analysis of data, it was concluded that headteachers selected directly by Punjab Public Service Commission had better school management effectiveness as compared to promoted headteachers. It was clear that direct selectee headteachers were more effective in enhancing enrollment and producing better PEC and BISE results than promoted headteachers.

Key Words: Management, Effectiveness, Promoted, Selectee, Administration.

Introduction

In Punjab province of Pakistan, the person employed by the education authority to frame and implement policies and programs in the high schools are generally classified as Headmaster/Headmistress, Senior Headmaster/Headmistress, and Principals based on their basic pay scale (BPS). The Headmaster of BPS-17 posted at high schools with low enrollment of students or newly upgraded schools. The Senior Headmaster of BPS-18 appointed in high enrollment schools while the Principals BPS-19 posted in the schools with higher enrollment or higher secondary schools. The headteachers may specialize in a specific area like management, school organization and specific initiative relating to an issue of current concern. A headteacher leads, manage and develops teams of educational experts.

A headteacher is a qualified teacher appointed to undertake the management and administrative responsibilities involved in running a school. The major responsibilities are providing leadership and ensuring high standards of education, development plans, and performance management, managing and organizing staff and resources managing the curriculum and promoting good relations with parents and the community. (Shukla, 2014)

All children have the right to know and grow through effective learning in multiple spaces. The principles of mutual respect apply to adults and children. The children have the right to express their views through listening and talking. They should be protected from aggression and violence through the responsibility of the teachers by preparing the lesson, maintaining positive classroom environment, discipline, undertaking their work and collaborating with children. To increase the changes in access to education government has put before the researchers and planners to find out solution to problems like higher student-teacher ratio, overcrowding of classes, lack of resource materials and lower standards of education. This has been put forward to develop the quality of education. Another issue is equity and efficiency which has the government’s concern to make the
education effective, develop satellite schools, ask the parents to send young girls to school, to make education equal and cost-effective for boys and girls. The priorities in the education as undertaken by government are progressive realization in the objective of universal access to primary and secondary education in view of right to education for all. Children's rights are expected to be honored through teacher-child relationship through mutual respect without letting lose the situation by the teacher. The rights to education are access to education, right to quality education and right to be respected (Express Tribune, March 30, 2011).

A school acts as a substitute for the discharge of responsibilities on behalf of the society, community or parents. School functions under the cultural restrictions of society where the teacher and taught are supposed to be the main pillars. School is an educational organization designed to provide learning activities and learning environment for the students to make good citizens. Peter Woods (2012) briefed thumbnail sketch of the Lowfield Secondary school in his writing “The Divided School” The school is well accommodated, with adequate classrooms, laboratories, science rooms, needlecrafts, lecture theatre, hall, library, impressive technical block, gymnasium, swimming pool and generous playing fields along with an atmosphere of balmy bliss. Public schools are universally available to every individual. These are run by the government of the time. Public schools are categorized as “primary schools, elementary schools, high schools, and higher secondary schools”. High schools have the grade from 1-10th. These schools have IT, physics, chemistry and biology labs. The master degree holder teachers are appointed in high schools for teaching of high classes. These teachers are designated as secondary school educators (SSE) for the contract and after regularization get the designation of a secondary school teacher (SST).

School Reforms Road Map

Focus on Schools

Computer labs provided in all high schools of the government of Punjab. The medium of instruction of schools changed from Urdu to English medium. Danish schools established for poor and intelligent students in Southern Punjab.

Enrollment 100%

There should be compulsory education up to the age of 16 is the basic requirement of every student. Plans survey of all admissible students and achieved 100% targets of enrollment.

Retention 100%

Retention is a major issue than the enrollment of the students. There is zero patience for dropouts.

Targets Based Ranking of Districts

The districts of the Punjab and district educational managers have been ranked on achieving indicators set by the government. The district officers review the progress every month.

Governance

All recruitment of teaching faculty and education administrators is purely made on merit. All headteachers and teaching staff will be responsible for new admissions, retention and improving the quality in the field of education “(Chief Minister’s school reforms road map, 2010)”.

Recruitment in Public Schools

School Education Department (SED) of Punjab government formulates a recruitment policy for recruiting school teachers. The nomenclature of posts, minimum criteria of academic and professional qualification, basic rules of recruitment, steps, and timelines of recruitment, job description, and ranking criteria for posts, allocation of posts, terms, and conditions of recruitment are laid down in the recruitment policy. A specific document called recruitment policy is a code of conduct for the recruitment of teachers. The advertisements for the recruitment
of teachers are published in leading daily newspapers. Teachers are recruited to fill all teaching posts, ensuring quality teaching and achieving 100% enrollment, 100% retention and zero drop out (Govt. of Punjab, Recruitment Policy 2016-17).

Two types of teachers are working in Government high schools in Punjab, Pakistan. One is promoted headteachers and other is selected headteachers. The working Secondary School Teachers (SSTs) and Headmasters and Senior Headmasters having prescribed qualification and length of service are promoted to higher scale with new designation and upgraded scale through School Education Department. These working persons don’t need to qualify any kind of test or any kind of interview for their promotion. The fresh and in-service teachers of lower grades applied for the post of Headmaster BS-17 while experienced persons applied for the post of Senior Headmaster BS-18.

Good administration and proper management was the responsibility of the head of the institution. This kind of good administration maintained discipline among teaching and non-teaching staff as well as the students, also organized and supervised the institution. The headteachers regularly and accurately maintained all registers and promoted the physical, social as well as ethical values among the students. It regularly participated in the work of teaching and arranged sports, games as well as co-curricular activities for the students in the institution (School Manual, Punjab education code #10).

Leadership played a significant role in the smooth running of any organization and directly affects the performance and growth of the employees. Effective leadership provides the basis for development and performance in organizations. Many characteristics (communication, honesty, humble, confident, motivation, creative, intellectual and cooperative) are commonly found in academic leaders. Leadership is a global phenomenon though it has influence of culture and context as well on it (Yasin, Batool & Ajmal, 2015). Leadership styles were the basic component in running the management at schools. Management and leadership styles were the two sides of a coin. Therefore, the responsibility of a head is very vital not only for identifying the weakness of school management as well as providing guidance for effective and efficient running of the schools. Ahmad and Dilshad (2016) concluded that school heads most frequently practiced democratic leadership style followed by authoritative and laissez-faire style.

Siddiqui, Panhwar and Shah (2017) highlighted the composition and strategy of educational leadership in the school education department. The common experiences in Pakistan showed that most of the school administrations believed in the evolution of anxiety, stress, and anticipation in juniors. Heads of the schools / Headmaster were developing only frustration and dissatisfaction in teaching staff. The role of Headmaster in the achievement of objectives was determined by educational administration, participation of parents, and improvement of students in academic performance. The betterment of educational organizations depended upon the performance of headteachers.

Nartisa, Putans, and Muravska (2012) have described that strategic planning was focused among public sector organizations and institutes on the part of management process. Mukherjee (2013) portrayed that there was a strong relationship found between performance of a school and the managerial effectiveness of the principal. The dimensions of managerial effectiveness of principals are appropriate delegation of work and responsibilities, appropriate performance appraisal of staff and participative decision making. The heads of the schools normally deploy a number of quality enhancement procedures i.e. teamwork, arranging workshops and promoting mentoring to enhance academic performance. (Lydiah & Nasongo, 2009).

Keeping in view the different scenarios of management of headteachers at public secondary school in Punjab province, this study was launched to compare the management effectiveness of direct selectees and promoted headteachers.

**Objective of the Study**

The objective of this research study was to compare the management effectiveness of direct selectees and promoted secondary school headteachers.

**Research Question**

Is there a difference in the effectiveness of the management between direct selectee secondary school headteachers and promoted secondary school headteachers?
Methods and Procedure of the Study

The study under consideration was descriptive in nature, so the survey approach was followed for data collection. There are four provinces of Pakistan i.e. Punjab, Sindh, Baluchistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK). The “Punjab province” was selected for this study. All district-level education officers and senior secondary school teachers (SSTs) both males, as well as females of Punjab, were the target population. The Punjab province categorically classified into three regional zones; southern zone, central zone, and north zone and administratively divided into nine divisions. Sahiwal division present in central Punjab selected by researcher. The reason for selecting Sahiwal division is one of the top-performing divisions in the Punjab province (PMIU/PESRP/PD/2017/16553, 2018) presented in the Performance Evaluation Index (PEI) developed and announced by the “Punjab Education Sector Reforms Programme–Programme Monitoring and Implementation Unit (PESRP-PMIU)”. All the district level education officers and senior secondary school Teachers (SSTs) of secondary schools located in Sahiwal division were the sampled population taken for the study. Three districts namely district Okara, district Sahiwal and district Pakpattan constitute the Sahiwal division. There are four hundred and sixty-four (464) headteachers. Among the four hundred and sixty-four (464) headteachers, one hundred and fifty-five (155) headteachers directly selected through qualifying examination or test and interview conducted by Punjab Public Service Commission while three hundred and nine (309) promoted headteachers. One senior Secondary School Teacher (SST) from all the schools where selectee and promoted headteachers posted taken as a sample for the study. One Chief Executive Officers (CEO), one District Education Officer (DEO) secondary and one Deputy District Education Officer (DyDEO) secondary taken as respondents from each districts of Sahiwal division, so the total sample comprised of (155+309) four hundred and sixty-four (464) senior secondary school teachers (SSTs) and nine district-level education officers selected through multi-stage random sampling. The district officers and senior secondary school teachers (SSTs) of the school are suitable respondents who inform better about the effectiveness of management of headteachers. Two research instruments were used, one questionnaire for the senior secondary school teachers and one structured interview schedule for the district level educational officers. The research instruments were piloted and validated before data collection. Reasonable face and content validity, reliability achieved by pilot testing and expert opinion, reliability were found at 0.83 by test and re-test approach.

Presentation and Analysis of Results

The results of the present study are presented and interpreted as given below:

Table 1. Comparison of Management of School Principals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S</th>
<th>Dimensions of Management of Schools</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Dev.</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Selectee</td>
<td>Promoted</td>
<td>Selectee</td>
<td>Promoted</td>
<td>Selectee</td>
<td>Promoted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Maintenance of discipline</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>3.573</td>
<td>3.490</td>
<td>1.0532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Maintenance of school infrastructure</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>3.657</td>
<td>3.781</td>
<td>.9764</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Promotion of co-curricular activities</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>3.728</td>
<td>3.200</td>
<td>1.0586</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Conduction of parent teacher meeting regularly</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>3.529</td>
<td>3.275</td>
<td>1.0470</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Emphasis on personality development of students</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>3.430</td>
<td>3.477</td>
<td>1.0808</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Establish safe and secure environment</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>3.430</td>
<td>2.974</td>
<td>1.0316</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1 shows that there is statistically significant difference between two groups of direct selectees and promoted headteachers for first nineteen (Sr. No. 1-19) measures of management of schools. The value of t-statistics for all these measures are significant at $\alpha=0.05$. The mean score values of different measures of management of schools like maintenance good discipline in schools, promotion of co-curricular activities, establish safe and secure
environment, conduct of parent-teacher meeting, assigning right task to the right person, implementation of advanced assessment techniques, establishment of quality education, encouraging various methods of students evaluation, students’ progress monitored continuously, teachers teaching activities monitored regularly and improvement in PEC and BISE results are better in direct selectee headteachers schools as compared to promoted headteachers schools. The mean score values of different measures of management of schools like maintenance of school infrastructure, emphasis on personality development of students, establish sound collaboration with community, reduction in dropout rate, appropriate sharing of power and authority, promotion of professional skills, provision of necessary school physical facilities and promotion of a good school climate are better in promoted headteachers schools as compared to direct selectee headteachers schools.

Table 1 shows that there is no statistically significant difference are found between two groups of direct selectee and promoted headteachers for last six (Sr. No. 20-25) measures of management of schools. The value of t-statistics for all these measures are not significant at \( \alpha = 0.05 \). The mean score value of different measures of management of schools like developing a culture of mutual trust and respect, take right decision at the right time, enhancement in enrollment rate and maintenance of retention is better in schools where direct selectee headteachers posted as compared to promoted headteachers schools. The mean score value of different measures of management of schools like establishment of friendly environment and formulating a time table that supports functioning of the school is better in promoted schools as compared to selectee schools.

### Analysis of the interview Schedule for Educational Administrators

**Table 2. Opinions about the Effective Management of Direct Selectee and Promoted Headteachers in School Education Department**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Opinions</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The direct selectee headteachers are more effective in managing schools than promoted headteachers</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>55.555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The promoted headteachers are more effective in managing schools than direct selectee headteachers</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>44.444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The promoted headteachers are more effective in enhancing enrollment than direct selectee headteachers</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>33.333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The direct selectee headteachers are more effective in enhancing enrollment than promoted headteachers</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>66.666</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The direct selectee headteachers are more effective in reduction in dropout rate than promoted headteachers</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>55.555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The promoted headteachers are more effective in reduction in dropout rate than direct selectee headteachers</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>44.444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The promoted headteachers are more effective in improving PEC and BISE results than direct selectee headteachers</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>33.333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The direct selectee headteachers are more effective in improving PEC and BISE results than promoted headteachers</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>66.666</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The overall management of promoted headteachers is more effective than direct selectee headteachers</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>33.333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The overall management of direct selectee headteachers is more effective than promoted headteachers</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>55.555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No comments</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11.111</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 shows that 55.55% respondents were of the view that direct selectee headteachers are more effective in managing schools than promoted headteachers while 44.44% respondents respond that promoted headteachers are more effective in managing schools than direct selectee headteachers. Three research participants (33.33%)
were agreed that promoted headteachers are more effective in enhancing enrollment than direct selectee headteachers and six research participants (66.66%) were agree that direct selectee headteachers are more effective in enhancing enrollment than promoted headteachers. Five respondents (55.55%) respond that direct selectee headteachers are more effective in reduction in dropout rate than promoted headteachers whereas four respondents (44.44%) respond that promoted headteachers are more effective in reduction in dropout rate than direct selectee headteachers. Three research participants (33.33%) were of the view promoted headteachers are more effective in improving PEC and BISE results than direct selectee headteachers and six research participants (66.66%) respond that direct selectee headteachers are more effective in improving PEC and BISE results than promoted headteachers. Three research participants (33.33%) were of the opinion that overall management of promoted headteachers are more effective than direct selectee headteachers while five research participants (55.55%) respond that overall management of direct selectee headteachers is more effective than promoted headteachers and one respondent (11.11%) did not comment about the comparison of effective management of promoted and selectee headteachers.

**Discussion and Conclusions**

The majority of heads wanted to accommodate young graduates into existing school leadership teams, or existing school structures to attain the youth point of view on a given assignment to include and put their importance in school management which improves continuously. The existing structures had different departments, scheduled time table of meetings, better organizational school hierarchy along with a well-designed playground. The youth-adult partnership’s potential led schools to carry forward to incorporate youth into adult command places like leadership teams and minimized a concentration on the activity of adding youth as partners in school improvement or governance as a way of re-centering discussions in schools on the experiences of peripherals youth in schools (Biddle, 2017).

Schools are the “basic platforms for the growth and development of children and teachers”. The public and private sectors are important in this regard. “Liaison and interaction between both sectors are required to make the educational system more structured. It is very important to employ well educated and well-experienced teachers to bring the educational system up to the mark”. Maqsood, Sohail, Qureshi, and Kausar (2017) explained job satisfaction among teachers. A survey-based research design was launched and, job satisfaction scale and demographic sheet were administered. The demographic variables like “age and income indicated negative correlation with job satisfaction whereas experience indicated positive relationship”. The teachers having “job experience (1-5 years) were significantly different from teachers having more than 5 years of experience regarding job satisfaction”. Employees were satisfied with their jobs in a stress-free academic environment.

The enhancement of emotional behavior problems reduces academic achievement whereas high social self-esteem was associated with higher academic achievement. In the school children, the reduction of behavioral problems by rising social self-esteem which in turn enhances academic achievement (Soomro & Clarbour, 2012).

Modern research indicates that managing a school is like managing a state. Therefore the school administrator works like a politician, economist, psychologist and sociologist. The school head is the leader and manager of the school. Headship and leadership are a unique task and require extra knowledge and experience. The word principal consists of nine alphabet letters and the researcher derived nine characteristics from these alphabet letters. P indicates plans school activities, R indicates respect the school population, I relates to indicates and commands school population, N indicates networks to the school population, C indicates consults with school population, I indicates instructs school staff, P indicates participates in school activities, A indicates attracts school population and L stands for leads school population to the right direction (Farah, 2013).

The aim of the principal is to ensure high academic performance in achieving the school mission. Effective principals have two types of task-dimensions. One type includes a managerial task that is associated with policies, rules, procedures, and authority. The second type comprised of building cultural linkages (Lumenburg, 2010). Muraina and Babatunde (2014) indicated that there was a significant relationship found between principals’ managerial skills as well as administrative effectiveness.

The different dimensions of management of schools like maintenance of discipline, promotion of co-curricular activities, conduction of parent-teacher meeting regularly, establish safe and secure environment,
assigning right task to the right person, implementation of advanced assessment techniques, establishment of quality education, encouraging various methods of students evaluation, students’ progress monitored continuously, teachers teaching activities monitored regularly, improvement in Punjab Examination Commission (PEC) and boards (BISE) results, developing a culture of mutual trust and respect, take right decision at the right time, enhancement in enrollment rate and maintenance of retention are better in schools where direct selectee headteachers appointed as compared to promoted headteachers schools.

The different measures of management of schools like maintenance of school infrastructure, emphasis on personality development of students, establish sound collaboration with community, reduction in dropout rate, appropriate sharing of power and authority, promotion of professional skills, establishment of friendly environment, formulating a time table, provision of necessary school physical facilities and promotion of a good school climate are more effective in promoted headteachers schools as compared to direct selectee headteachers schools. So, this study concluded that overall management of direct selectee headteachers is more effective than promoted headteachers. Policymakers may formulate the policies for the effective management of schools and headteachers may provide training related to administration, management, and decision making process on regular basis.
References


